Study on the Cooperation Between HEIs and Public and Private Organisations in Europe

HIPPO
DG Education and Culture

Largest study into European university-business cooperation (UBC)...

6,280 responses from rectors and academics.

THIRD ASEM UNIVERSITY – BUSINESS FORUM 2012
“DRIVING INNOVATION”
PUTRA WORLD TRADE CENTRE
KUALA LUMPUR
5 – 6 NOVEMBER 2012
Prof. Dr. Thomas Baaken, Münster Germany
Acknowledgement

Authors of the study:

Prof. Thomas Baaken
Todd Davey
Victoria Galan Muros
Arno Meerman

www.ub-cooperation.eu
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Secondary information search | - Literature,  
- Published reports (national and EU level),  
- Books,  
- Journals. |
| 2. Qualitative research | 10 expert interviews |
| 3. Quantitative research | - Survey translated into 22 languages,  
- Sent to all European HEIs (3551 HEIs),  
- 33 countries,  
- Survey sample = 6,280,  
- Representative sample achieved. |
| 4. Qualitative workshop | 12 experts in UBC met in Brussels |
| 5. Case studies | 30 good practice European UBC case studies |
METHOD: Countries involved

PARTICIPATING COUNTRIES

Countries that are existing, or candidate members, of the European Union or are partly committed to the EU economy and regulations as member of the European Economic Alliance (EEA) were targets of the study.

Involved in study
RESULTS: Total UBC

ACADEMICS

4,123 academics responded to the major study

HEI REPRESENTATIVES

2,157 from HEI Mngt. responded to the major study

6,280 total responses
RESULT 1: UBC is crucial to building a knowledge society through:

1. knowledge transfer,
2. creation of new technologies,
3. providing people with effective skills and knowledge

Impact level
(Economic development
Contribution to society generally

Outcome level
Outcomes for HEIs
Contribution to teaching, research and knowledge transfer at a HEI

Result level
University-Business Cooperation
RESULT 2: The UBC ecosystem is complex and integrated

European UBC is influenced by a large number of factors including:

1. **Influencing factors**
2. **Mechanisms that support UBC (The ‘4 Pillars’)**
3. **Key stakeholders**

---

**Result level**

**University-Business Cooperation**

**Factor level**

**Influencing factors**
Factors influencing UBC including perceived benefits of UBC, drivers and barriers to UBC, situational factors affecting UBC

**The ‘4 Pillars’**
Mechanisms that support UBC including strategies, structures & approaches, activities and framework conditions for UBC

**Key Stakeholders**
Key UBC stakeholders including HEIs (Academic, management and KTPs), Government (EU, national, regional) Business
1 of every 3 HEIs undertake no or a very low amount of UBC activity

- **No UBC**: 8%
- **Low UBC**: 26%
- **Med-high UBC**: 66%

**n=2136**
RESULT 4: There are 8 types of UBC

UBC is more than the creation of patents, licences and contract research.

There are eight different ways in which HEIs and business cooperate

1. Collaboration in research and development (R&D),
2. Mobility of academics,
3. Mobility of students,
4. Commercialisation of R&D results,
5. Curriculum development and delivery,
6. Lifelong learning (LLL),
7. Entrepreneurship,
8. Governance.
RESULTS: Types of UBC

- Collaboration in R&D: 5.0
- Mobility of students: 4.3
- Commercialisation of R&D results: 4.0
- Lifelong learning: 4.0
- Curriculum development and delivery: 3.8
- Entrepreneurship: 3.3
- Governance: 2.9
- Mobility of academics: 2.9

n=3460

ACAD
# RESULTS: Types of UBC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Average Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration in R&amp;D</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobility of students</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercialisation of R&amp;D results</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifelong learning</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum development and delivery</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobility of academics</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **n=1753**

- **Not at all**, **Low**, **Medium**, **High**
RESULT 5: Situational factors partly explain UBC

All ‘situational factors’ play a role in influencing the extent of UBC

- Gender
- Years working in the HEI
- Age
- Country
- The type of HEI they work for

Faculty

Total University-Business Cooperation

- Benefits
- Drivers & Barriers
- Situational Factors
### SIT. FACT: Years in Business

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years in business</th>
<th>Total UBC*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;0 - 2</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 – 5</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 – 9</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 - 19</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 + years</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Scale: 1 = none, >1 - 4 = low; >4 - 7 = medium; >7 - 10 = high*

Significantly lower for those with less than 2 years of experience in business,

‘Diminishing returns’= 5 years working in business,

Technology and Engineering have the highest level of UBC.
Q7. Extent of cooperation per country (combined) *(min 30 respondents)*
Please indicate to what extent you / your HEI cooperates with business *(mean of all)*

**Highest extent of UBC**
1. Sweden
2. Denmark
3. United Kingdom

**Lowest extent of UBC**
1. Austria
2. Italy
3. Poland

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macedonia</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyprus</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## SIT. FACTORS v Types of UBC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Collaboration in R&amp;D</th>
<th>Mobility of academics</th>
<th>Mobility of students</th>
<th>Commercialisation of R&amp;D results</th>
<th>Curriculum development and delivery</th>
<th>Lifelong learning</th>
<th>Entrepreneurship</th>
<th>Governance</th>
<th>Total UBC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Scale:** 1 = No UBC, >1 - 4 = low; >4 - 7 = medium; >7 - 10 = high

### GERMANY

**European leaders in UBC**
- 1. Collaboration in R&D
- 2. Mobility of students
- 3. Commercialisation of R&D

**Below average extent of UBC**
- 1. Curriculum development & Delivery
- 2. Lifelong learning
- 3. Governance
RESULT 6: BARRIERS

Most important barriers for **academics**

1. Bureaucracy within or external to the HEI (7.3)
2. Lack of HEI funding for UBC (6.9)
3. Lack of external funding for UBC (6.9)

Most important barriers for **HEIs**

1. Lack of external funding for UBC (7.0)
2. Lack of financial resources of the business (6.9)
3. Business lack awareness of HEI activities (6.9)

**Scale:**

1 = No UBC, >1 - 4 = low ; >4 - 7 = medium ; >7 - 10 = high
RESULT 7: DRIVERS (most important)

Most important drivers for academics

1. Existence of mutual trust (7.4)
2. Existence of mutual commitment (7.0)
3. Having a shared goal (7.0)

Most important drivers for HEIs

1. Existence of mutual trust (7.5)
2. Existence of mutual commitment (7.1)
3. Having a shared goal (7.1)

Scale: 1 = No UBC, >1 - 4 = low ; >4 - 7 = medium ; >7 - 10 = high
Q24. Please indicate the extent to which you agree or disagree with the following statements.

- UB activities improve employability of future graduates
- UB activities improve the learning experience of students
- UB activities improve the performance of business
- Successful UBC is an excellent way of getting funding
- Successful UBC increases my reputation in my field of research
- Successful UBC is vital to achieving the mission of the university
- Successful UBC is vital to my research
- UB activities improves my standing within the university
- UB activities increase my chances of promotion

n=2394

**Personal benefits for academics**

**Benefits for students, business or the HEI**
**E3. Please indicate the extent to which you agree or disagree with the following statements.**

- UBC increases skills and graduate development
- UBC has beneficial effects on the local industry
- UBC is vital to achieving the mission of the HEI
- UBC improves regional productivity
- UBC creates local employment
- UBC increases local GDP and disposable income
- UBC creates a range of beneficial social and recreational benefits

**ACAD**

n=313
RESULT 9: 4 PILLARS (developm. vs impact)

DEVELOPMENT

Most important developed of the

The extent of development of the 4 Pillars from most developed to least is:
1. Operational activities (5.4),
2. Structures and approaches (5.1),
3. Strategies (4.9), and
4. Framework conditions (4.5).

IMPACT

Most biggest impact on UBC from the Pillars:

The extent of development of the 4 Pillars from most developed to least is:
1. Strategies (58%)
2. Operational activities (53%),
3. Structures and approaches (52%), and
4. Framework conditions (40%).

A greater focus on strategies (especially implementation strategies) is required

Scale: 1 = No UBC, >1 - 4 = low ; >4 - 7 = medium ; >7 - 10 = high

Science Marketing  
Science-to-Business Research Centre Germany
RESULT 10: UBC Ecosystem

University-Business Cooperation

8 types of UBC

Result level
- Collaboration in R&D
- Academic mobility
- Student mobility
- Commercialisation of R&D results
- Curriculum development & delivery
- Lifelong learning
- Entrepreneurship
- Governance

Factor level
- Benefits
- Drivers
- Barriers
- Situational Factors

Action level
- 1. Strategies
- 2. Structures & approaches
- 3. Activities
- 4. Framework Conditions

Analysis takes place in this direction

Types of UBC:
- Business
- HEIs
- Government

- Mngt.
- KTPs
- ACAD
- Business
- EU
- Nat.
- Local
So what does this mean for HEIs, Govt. and key stakeholders?

A new paradigm is in play

New thinking is required to develop our societies through UBC

A more holistic approach to UBC is required beyond:

• Patents and licenses
• Paper strategies (mission / vision)
• Just HEIs and business
• Creating a science park
• One-off, short-term interactions
…
Contact

Contact persons

Todd Davey
davey@fh-muenster.de

Prof. Dr. Thomas Baaken
baaken@fh-muenster.de

Science-to-Business Marketing Research Centre Germany
Münster University of Applied Sciences
Corrensstr. 25
D-48149 Münster
Germany
Tel.: +49 251 83-65683
Fax: +49 251 83-65534
Web: www.science-marketing.de